WEST BENGAL ADMINISTRATIVE TRIBUNAL

Present-

The Hon'ble Justice Ranjit Kumar Bag

& The Hon'ble Subesh Kumar Das

Case No - OA 341 of 2015.

Chandan Deb – Vs- State of W.B. & Ors.

Serial No. and Date of order. 1	Order of the Tribunal with signature 2	Office action with date and dated signature of parties when necessary 3
<u>15</u> 03.05.2018.	For the Applicant : Mrs. S. Mitra, Ld. Adv.	
	For the State Respondents : Mr. S. Ghosh, Ld. Adv.	
	The applicant participated in the selection	
	process for recruitment to the post of Sub Assistant	
	Engineer (Mechanical) on contractual basis under Water	
	Resources Development Directorate, Government of	
	West Bengal in response to the advertisement in the year	
	2014. The contention of the applicant is that his name	
	appeared in serial No. 4 of the result sheet, whereas one	
	Subhasis Ghosh whose name appeared in serial No. 59 of	
	the said result sheet has already got the appointment.	
	The further contention of the applicant is that the name	
	of the applicant is absent from the list of 27 selected	
	candidates for the post of Sub Assistant Engineer	
	(Mechanical) . It is also contended that the name of the	
	applicant was also absent from the list of 04 selected	
	candidates whose names were subsequently published	
	on January 20, 2015 for appointment to the post of Sub	
	Assistant Engineer (Mechanical). By filing written	

CHANDAN DEB.

Vs.

The State of West Bengal & Ors.

Case No. OA 341 of 2015.			
Serial No. and Date of order. 1	Order of the Tribunal with signature 2	Office action with date and dated signature of parties when necessary 3	
	objection to the status report submitted on behalf of the		
	state respondents, the applicant has challenged the		
	decision of the respondents that he was over aged for		
	appointment to the post of Sub Assistant Engineer		
	(Mechanical) on contractual basis. Mrs. Mitra, Learned		
	Counsel for the applicant contends that the upper age		
	limit of 30 years for recruitment to the post of Sub		
	Assistant Engineer(Mechanical) in the Directorate of		
	Water Resources Development will not be applicable in		
	the present case of the applicant, as his name was		
	sponsored by Employment Bank by the Director of		
	Employment who has fixed the age limit from 18 to 45		
	years for recruitment to the said post. She further		
	contends that the Department of Public Works,		
	Government of West Bengal has intimated to the		
	applicant on March 23, 2017 on the basis of application		
	under Right to Information Act, 2005 that there was no		
	age limit for engagement of Sub Assistant Engineer on		
	contractual basis under Public Works Department and as		
	such, the age limit as contended on behalf of the		
	respondents cannot have any manner of application on		
	the applicant.		
	Mr. Ghosh Learned Counsel for the state		

Mr. Ghosh, Learned Counsel for the state

Form No.

Case No. <u>OA 341 of 2015</u>

CHANDAN DEB.

Vs.

The State of West Bengal & Ors.

Case No. OA 341 of 2015.			
Serial No. and Date of order. 1	Order of the Tribunal with signature 2	Office action with date and dated signature of parties when necessary 3	
	respondents submits that the maximum age limit for	5	
	recruitment to the post of Sub Assistant Engineer		
	(Mechanical) on contractual basis will be 30 years as		
	disclosed in the advertisement of the year 2014, as the		
	said age limit will be decided in terms of Notification		
	No.3179-Estab.(Cell-II)/12A-17/91 dated November 04,		
	1997 of the Department of Water Investigation &		
	Development and order No. 144-Estt(Cell II)/WI/O/12A-		
	58/2009 dated January 21, 2014 issued by Department of		
	Water Resources Investigation & Development. He		
	further submits that the present applicant was over aged		
	on 01 st day of January of the year of advertisement and		
	as such he could not be given appointment to the post of		
	Sub Assistant Engineer (Mechanical) on contractual basis.		
	Having heard Learned Counsel representing		
	both parties and on consideration of the advertisement		
	in question, we find that the age limit for the post of Sub		
	Assistant Engineer(Mechanical) on contractual basis will		
	be decided as per rule framed by the Government of		
	West Bengal for direct appointment to the said post. In		
	view of such disclosure in the advertisement itself, the		
	maximum age limit for recruitment to the post of Sub		
	Assistant Engineer(Mechanical) on contractual basis will		

Case No. OA 341 of 2015.

Form No.

CHANDAN DEB.

•••• Vs.

The State of West Bengal & Ors.

Case No. <u>OA 341 of 2015.</u>			
Serial No. and Date of order. 1	Order of the Tribunal with signature 2	Office action with date and dated signature of parties when necessary 3	
	be 30 years as per Notification dated November 04, 1997		
	and order dated January 21, 2014 which are disclosed in		
	paragraph 4 of the status report submitted on behalf of		
	the respondents. The age limit for engagement of Sub		
	Assistant Engineer on contractual basis in Public Works		
	Department can not have any application in the present		
	case where recruitment is done by the Directorate of		
	Water Resources Development. Moreover, it is		
	immaterial whether the candidature of the applicant was		
	sponsored by Employment Bank or the applicant		
	submitted application directly in response to the		
	advertisement in question as the age limit in the present		
	case is to be decided on the basis of norms laid down in		
	the advertisement itself.		
	In view of our above findings, we do not find		
	any merit in the submission made on behalf of the		
	applicant. Since the applicant was over aged on the 01^{st}		
	day of January of the year of advertisement, he cannot be		
	given appointment as contended on behalf of the		
	applicant.		
	As a result, the Original Application is		
	dismissed.		
	Let a Plain copy of the order be supplied to		

Form No.

CHANDAN DEB.

Vs.

The State of West Bengal & Ors.

Case No.	<u>OA 341 of 2015.</u>	
----------	------------------------	--

Case No. OA 341 of 2015.			
Serial No. and	Order of the Tribuna	l with signature	Office action with date
Date of order.	2	6	and dated signature
1			of parties when necessary
			3
	both parties.		
	(S.K.Das)	(R.K.Bag)	
	Member (A)	Member (J).	
Skg.			

Form No.

CHANDAN DEB.

....

Vs.

The State of West Bengal & Ors.

Case No. OA 341 of 2015.

The State of	west bengal & Ors.

Case No. <u>OA 341 of 20</u> 2	_	
Serial No. and	Order of the Tribunal with signature	Office action with date and dated signature
Date of order.	2	of parties when necessary
1		3

Form No.